“But what do they DO with what they find?”

Asking hard questions about – and taking a hard look at – student research papers

Carrie Ludovico  Carol Wittig
University of Richmond
“Finding” is no longer the problem...
They can find things, but what do they do with them?
Inspired by the national Citation Project, we decided to take action...
Action begins with knowledge.
“But that’s not true of our students!”
All First-Year Seminars have the same five common goals:

• expand and deepen students' understanding of the world and of themselves
• enhance their ability to read and think critically
• enhance their ability to communicate effectively, in writing, speech, and other appropriate forms
• develop the fundamentals of information literacy and library research
• provide the opportunity for students to work closely with a faculty mentor
Pilot process taught us a huge amount.
How much do they use sources? (A lot!)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation #</th>
<th>Page in the paper</th>
<th>Source # used</th>
<th>Type of Source</th>
<th>Page in source</th>
<th>X if more than one type of source used</th>
<th>Inaccurate or Incomplete Citation</th>
<th>Copying not marked as quotation</th>
<th>Copying marked as quotation</th>
<th>Patchwriting</th>
<th>Paraphrasing</th>
<th>Summarizing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4J</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4J</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4J</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3J</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3J</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3J</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2J</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2J</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2J</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5J</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5J</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5J</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6J</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What does the process look like?
What kind of sources do they cite?

- Book: 44%
- Journal Article: 22%
- Website: 19%
- News Source: 3%
- Multimedia: 1%
- Reference: 2%
- Magazine: 4%
- Not Found: 3%
- Government Document: 1%
How good are they at acknowledging sources?

- Correct: 65%
- Inaccurate/Incomplete: 35%
How do they integrate sources?
What sort of errors do they make in citation?

- Inaccurate quotation: 14%
- Unable to determine location of citation in source: 43%
- Inaccurate source cited: 10%
- Cited from preface/intro: 2%
- Inaccurate page reference: 4%
- Inaccurate author reference: 1%
- Uncited: 6%
- Internally cited but not in reference list: 6%
- Should have been cited as a secondary quotation: 7%
- Citation from abstract: 4%
- Found in web search: 1%

References were largely on a discussion of a secondary…
What were our “lessons learned?”
Now what?
Questions? Comments?